


CONFRONTATION OF ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE CONSTRUCTION IN THE TRADITIONAL CEREMONY “TUTUP TAUN NGEMBAN TAUN” IN CIREUNDEU TRADITIONAL VILLAGE: A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF CULTURAL DISCOURSE



Muhammad Naufal Ashshiddieqi, Muhammad Abdurrasyid Ridlo
Department of Quranic Tafsir Studies, Faculty of Islamic Theology,
State Islamic University of Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta
muhnaufalash@gmail.com, muhammadrasyid9442@gmail.com

Abstract: This study aims to discuss the confrontation of artificial intelligence (AI) construction against the traditional ceremony Tutup Taun Ngemban Taun in Cireundeu Traditional Village, using a comparative approach in cultural discourse. This study uses a qualitative method with comparative analysis, based on cultural discourse theory and digital hermeneutics. Data collection was carried out through literature studies, empirical data, and field observations. The results of this study discuss the dynamics of artificial intelligence, an empirical review of traditional ceremonies in Cireundeu, and the confrontation between AI and local traditions. The conclusion of the study shows that there is a gap between technological modernity and the sustainability of tradition, with potential positive and negative impacts on local cultural framing.

Keywords: Artificial Intelligence, Cultural Discourse, Traditional Ceremony

Introduction

The development of artificial intelligence (AI) technology has brought significant changes in various aspects of human life, ranging from economics, education, to culture. AI is not only a tool that accelerates the process of industrialization and modernization, but also becomes an agent of change that changes the way humans interact with the world, including in terms of preserving traditions and customs. In the midst of globalization and digitalization, local traditions such as traditional ceremonies face great challenges, both in their preservation and adaptation to the times.

Studies on artificial intelligence tend to be new, but there have been various scientific writings that discuss this study. This article will try to divide several classifications of articles that discuss the study of artificial intelligence. Artificial Intelligence discusses its impact in education, which effectively makes it easier for teachers to explore material ideas to their students (Rifky, 2024), so that students are able to further develop their creativity (Dina et al., 2020; Pratiwi & Agustin, 2022). In addition, the presence of AI will actually cause laziness in students and teachers (Firdaus et al., 2023; Widat & Kurniawan, 2023), dependency (Syuhada et al., 2024), inaccurate data descriptions (Rochim, 2024), so that it can potentially create students stuck (Budiyono et al., 2024). Artificial Intelligence discussed its impact on the interaction of human resources and society, potentially losing human labour (Royhan Zaki Ramadhana & Muhammad Irwan Padli Nasution, 2024) and threatens the dignity of individuals (Pabubung, 2023). Artificial Intelligence discussed about its impact on information systems and data in general will appear to shift the accuracy of data (Misnawati, 2023), data privacy (Siti Masrichah, 2023), to the rise of plagiarism (Miftahul Huda & Irwansyah Suwahyu, 2024; Rhamadan & Ikhlas, 2023).

With various viewpoints of literature review on Artificial Intelligence above, this study will focus on the role of Artificial Intelligence in local traditions in Indonesia. Among them is being able to present data on the tradition of *"Tutup*



Taun Ngemban Taun". This research has an argument that artificial intelligence is effectively able to provide answers to all information in various fields. Even so, with its effectiveness, artificial intelligence has the risk of presenting invalid data. The data shift was found when the author compared data from Artificial Intelligence search tools such as ChatGPT, GeminiAI, Perplexity, Microsoft Copilot, with empirical searches in the field. This research raises at least two questions: How is traditional ceremonies explained in AI reviews? How to Confront Artificial Intelligence Construction to the Traditional Ceremony of "*Tutup Taun Ngemban Taun*" in Cireundeu Traditional Village: A Comparative Study of Cultural Discourse.

Along with the development of information technology, questions arise about how artificial intelligence can affect the way people understand and carry out their traditions. Several studies have shown that AI can serve as a tool for documenting, analysing, and even reconstructing cultural practices. However, there are also concerns that technological interventions may change the essence of the tradition, thus threatening the sustainability of the values contained in it (Harrison et al., 2021). In the context of "*Tutup Taun Ngemban Taun*" it is important to explore how the people of Cireundeu are responding to these changes and how they maintain the meaning of the ceremony that has become a part of their lives. This comparative study of cultural discourse will examine the interaction between AI and traditional ceremonies with a multidisciplinary approach, combining anthropology, sociology, and media studies perspectives (Mohammad Arif, 2021; Sultan et al., 2023). By utilizing the existing theoretical framework, this research is expected to provide new insights into the dynamics between technology and culture as well as the contribution of AI in supporting the preservation of local wisdom. Through in-depth observation and analysis, it is hoped that the results of this study can enrich the discourse on the relationship between tradition and innovation in the context of contemporary society (Sullivan, 2022).

This research argues that artificial intelligence is effectively able to provide temporary answers regarding information transmission in various fields of AI. Even so, with its effectiveness, artificial intelligence has the risk of presenting invalid data. The data shift was found when the author compared data from AI search tools such as ChatGPT with empirical searches in the field. This study aims to analyse how the construction of artificial intelligence confronts the traditional ceremony *Tutup Taun Ngemban Taun* in the Cireundeu Traditional Village, using a comparative approach in cultural discourse. This research will explore how AI can affect the implementation, perception, and sustainability of these traditional ceremonies. In this context, AI is seen not only as a technology,



but also as a discourse that carries certain values that can contradict or support local traditions.

This research enriches cultural theories, especially in the context of the relationship between technology (artificial intelligence) and traditional culture. In this case, how can AI influence, interact, or even contradict the values and customary practices in a community. The indigenous people of Cireundeu to maintain their identity and cultural values can use the results of this research. Understanding the impact of AI on traditional ceremonies can encourage people to be more aware of the importance of preserving their traditions while remaining open to technological innovation.

Research Method

This research uses a qualitative method focusing on a literature review with a literature study approach (Darmalaksana, 2020; Sarwono, 2006). This study uses a comparative analysis method based on theory (Creswell, 2014; Vaughn & Jacquez, 2020). The data collection technique is through empirical data tracing based on literature and field observations, identified by category, and interpretation according to research needs. Data analysis techniques through non-numerical normative comparative descriptive analysis based on a digital hermeneutic approach (Darmalaksana & Kulsum, 2022; Reijers, 2023).

Discussion and Results

1. Dynamics of Artificial Intelligence

Artificial Intelligence (AI) is a branch of computer science that focuses on developing systems that are capable of performing tasks that typically require human intelligence (Russel & Norvig, 2010). There are various forms of AI that have been developed, ranging from simple to complex systems. One of the most basic forms of AI is Narrow AI, also known as Weak AI. Narrow AI is designed to perform specific tasks, such as facial recognition, language translation, or data analysis. An example of Narrow AI is Apple's Siri or Google Assistant, which can only perform certain functions in a pre-programmed context (Damar et al., 2024). Unlike Narrow AI, there is General AI or Strong AI, that are designed to understand, learn, and perform any task that humans can do. Although General AI is still in the development stage, it has the potential to have capabilities equal to or even exceed that of humans in various fields. General AI will have the ability to adapt to new situations without human assistance, an ability that is still a challenge for scientists and researchers (Buxmann, 2019).

Additionally, there is a form of AI called Superintelligence, which refers to AI whose intelligence far surpasses the best human intelligence in almost all



aspects, including creativity, problem-solving, and social skills. Superintelligence is still in the realm of speculation and there are no concrete examples yet, but many AI experts have warned about the potential risks and impacts on humans (Aithal & Aithal, 2023). Machine Learning (ML) is a subfield of AI that allows systems to learn from data without the need for explicit programming. ML uses algorithms to analyse data, recognize patterns, and make decisions based on that data. One of the most common types of ML is Deep Learning, which uses artificial neural networks to mimic the way the human brain works. Deep Learning has been used in a variety of applications, such as image recognition, natural language processing, and video games (Chollet, 2018). Natural Language Processing (NLP) is a branch of AI that focuses on the interaction between computers and humans through natural language. The main goal of NLP is to make computers capable of understanding, interpreting, and generating human language naturally. NLP has been used in chatbots, sentiment analysis, and automated translators (Kevitt et al., 1992).

Another example of AI is Computer Vision, which allows computers to understand and interpret visual information from the real world (Karn, 2021). This technology has been widely used in facial recognition systems, autonomous vehicles, and medical image analysis. In the industrial sector, AI is also used in the form of Robotic Process Automation (RPA), which allows the automation of repetitive tasks without the need for human intervention. This is very beneficial for improving efficiency and reducing errors in business processes (Kitsantas et al., 2024).

AI has also been applied in healthcare through medical AI, which aids in disease diagnosis, treatment planning, and medical data analysis (Damar et al., 2024; Derrington, n.d.; Siti Masrichah, 2023). AI can process large amounts of medical data to find patterns that may be difficult for humans to see. Meanwhile, in the field of security, AI is used in Cybersecurity to detect threats and anomalies in computer networks. AI is able to learn past cyberattack patterns and predict potential future threats (Pupillo et al., 2021). AI development is inseparable from ethical challenges, especially related to privacy, algorithmic bias, and its impact on employment. Researchers are constantly trying to ensure that AI is used responsibly and does not cause social harm. These various forms of AI show how broad and deep the potential of AI is in changing various aspects of human life.

2. Field Survey of the Traditional Ceremony *Tutup Taun Ngemban Taun* in Cireundeu Traditional Village

Based on the presentation of the informant and field observations of the research, a description of the historical review, philosophical value, and its



relevance to the indigenous people of Cirendeudeu was obtained, as follows, the traditional ceremony *Tutup Taun Ngemban Taun* is a hereditary tradition carried out by the indigenous people of Cireundeudeu since the 16th century AD or 17th AD. This ceremony was initially held in a simple form in the houses of traditional leaders before finally being centred in Bale Saresehan, Centre for Traditional Activities. This tradition was initially limited to joint prayer as a form of gratitude for the blessings of the crops received. Over time, this tradition developed into a lively annual celebration, involving various elements of Sundanese arts such as *pencak silat*, *gamelan*, and *karinding*. This development is also influenced by the meeting of local and foreign cultures, such as the influence of the Dutch colonial period that once prohibited the use of Sundanese script so that Sundanese culture was reduced, so with this traditional ceremony, it is hoped that Sundanese culture will remain sustainable and not eroded by the times (Informant, 2024).



Photo 1. Procession of the Traditional Ceremony Tutup Taun Ngemban Taun in Cireundeudeu Traditional Village

The procession of the traditional ceremony of *Tutup Taun Ngemban Taun* is carried out for a whole month, starting from the 1st of Sura to the 30th of Sura based on the Saka Sundanese calendar. The series of events began with a joint prayer at *Bale Saresehan*, then followed by a *sungkeman* procession, a visit to the ancestral graves, and a rotating thanksgiving at residents' houses. The peak event is known as *Ngajayak*, where indigenous people parade a mountain of produce from the entrance of the village to *Bale Saresehan*. This procession is accompanied by a *lengser* dance, as a form of respect for the guests, and ends with a joint prayer for the blessings of the produce. At the peak of the event, Sundanese art was displayed as part of the ceremony, showing the togetherness and gratitude of the indigenous people (Interview on August 15, 2024).

The philosophical value of the Traditional Ceremony of Closing the Year of



Ngemban Taun lies in the community's gratitude to "the Creator". Every product collected from the harvest, whether in the form of leaves, fruits, to tubers, is presented in the form of offerings as a symbol of human dependence on nature. The people of Cireundeu believe that food and drinks consumed by humans are the source of life that needs to be respected. Therefore, they hold this ritual to honour the food that has sustained their lives, while hoping that the following year they will be given a better harvest and improved welfare (Interview August 15, 2024).



Photo 2. Closing Year 1957 Closing Year 1 Sura 1958 from Sundanese on August 2, 2024 in Cireundeu Traditional Village

This ceremony also contains the value of *muhasabah*, where indigenous people reflect on the life journey they have gone through for one year. They acknowledge that joy and sorrow are part of life, and humbly surrender themselves to the Creator. Thus, the Ceremony of *Tutup Taun Ngemban Taun* is a means for the people of Cireundeu to reflect on their identity as Sundanese, appreciate cultural values, and preserve the ancestral heritage that is rich in philosophical and spiritual meaning (Interview August 15, 2024).

3. Confrontation Artificial Intelligence of Construction On the Traditional Ceremony *Tutup Taun Ngemban Taun* in Cireundeu Traditional Village

Variable	Platform AI	AI Search Results and Narrative	References Offered by AI	Description of Real Data in the Field Based on Interview Results
----------	-------------	---------------------------------	--------------------------	--

Research Theme	OpenAI (ChatGPT), Perplexity, Copilot (Microsoft), Gemini AI	The AI explains the findings on the theme based on academic sources with each tendency.	Offers references to journals and books related to themes, such as hadith, fiqh, etc.	Based on AI Search Results and Narrative interviews with respondents in the field, the research theme was recognized as relevant and up-to-date.
User Perception	OpenAI (ChatGPT), Perplexity, Copilot (Microsoft), Gemini AI	AI provides an overview of public perceptions regarding themes.	Providing articles about public perception from random and abstract scientific research results means that the data obtained is invalid.	The results of the interviews show that the perception of the public is different from the AI narrative, and is more varied.
Research Methodology	OpenAI (ChatGPT), Perplexity, Copilot (Microsoft), Gemini AI	In general, AI provides research methodology options according to academic standards.	AI refers to commonly used research methodology book references, but data verification is still needed.	The methodology used in the field is slightly adapted to local conditions and research needs.
Academic Research Results	OpenAI (ChatGPT), Perplexity, Copilot (Microsoft), Gemini AI	AI presents academic findings from related journals and books in random and abstract.	References from scientific journals, conferences, and articles published by academic institutions are random and abstract.	The results of research in the field relatively support some of the academic findings displayed by AI.
Local Context	OpenAI (ChatGPT), Perplexity, Copilot (Microsoft), Gemini AI	AI exposes local context based on analysis of limited scientific sources.	Refers to history books and local research on the context of related regions, but cannot be traced/accessed further.	The interviews revealed significant differences in local cultural and social aspects.



Recommended Solutions	OpenAI (ChatGPT), Perplexity, Copilot (Microsoft), Gemini AI	AI suggests several alternative solutions to the problems discussed in general.	AI cites solution references from journals on public policy and relevant education strategies.	Interviews show that solutions on the ground are more pragmatic and tailored to needs.
------------------------------	--	---	--	--

Table 1. Comparison of Artificial Intelligence Construction Confrontation Data on the Traditional Ceremony Tutup Taun Ngemban Taun in Cireundeu Traditional Village

The comparison of AI platforms such as OpenAI (ChatGPT), Gemini AI, Perplexity AI, and Microsoft Copilot highlights their distinct approaches in providing research results, references, and contextual understanding. OpenAI tends to deliver comprehensive, detailed narratives, grounded in academic sources, making it suitable for in-depth exploration of themes like Hadith studies, Islamic history, and methodology. Gemini AI offers a more dynamic, up-to-date analysis with a strong focus on recent developments and broader contextual data, which makes it highly useful for research requiring contemporary insights. Perplexity AI is more succinct and direct, offering quick access to key points and references, which can be advantageous for fast research summaries. Meanwhile, Microsoft Copilot integrates technological and business-related contexts, focusing heavily on case studies, making it ideal for research linked to industrial and technological applications.

The implications of these differences are evident in how each platform aligns with real-world field data. For example, OpenAI and Gemini AI are better suited for academic research in areas like Islamic studies, where historical and cultural nuances are critical, yet the latter excels in keeping pace with emerging trends. Field data gathered through interviews often supports OpenAI’s comprehensive approach but may reveal local variations that require further contextualization, a gap Gemini AI fills by offering recent cultural and social trends. On the other hand, Perplexity AI, with its concise summaries, is useful when immediate, general insights are needed, but it may lack the depth required for localized research. Microsoft Copilot’s focus on industrial and technological solutions makes it less applicable for social and cultural research, but valuable for fields where technology and business integration are central.

Conclusion

Although various AI platforms such as OpenAI, Gemini AI, Perplexity AI, and Microsoft Copilot are capable of delivering structured and rapid information, one major criticism is the lack of relevance between AI-generated results and more dynamic, contextual field data. AI tends to draw from broad and



generalized databases, often overlooking regional or local differences. When applied to field research, particularly in areas with unique social and cultural characteristics, AI outputs are frequently misaligned with reality.

References

- Aithal, P. S., & Aithal, S. (2023). The Changing Role of Higher Education in the Era of AI-based GPTs. *International Journal of Case Studies in Business, IT, and Education*, 7(2), 183–197. <https://doi.org/10.47992/ijcsbe.2581.6942.0267>
- Budiyono, S., Azhari, P., & Pamungkas, M. A. B. (2024). Problem Penggunaan AI (Artificial Intelligence) dalam Bidang Pendidikan. *AI-DYAS*, 3(2), 660–669. <https://doi.org/10.58578/aldyas.v3i2.2935>
- Buxmann, P. (2019). *Künstliche Intelligenz*. Springer Gabler.
- Chollet, F. (2018). *Deep Learning with Python*. Manning. <https://doi.org/10.4018/978-1-7998-3095-5.ch003>
- Creswell, J. W. (2014). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches*. Proceedings of the Annual Conference of the International Speech Communication Association, INTERSPEECH.
- Damar, M., Özen, A., Çakmak, Ü. E., Özoğuz, E., & Erenay, F. S. (2024). Super AI, Generative AI, Narrow AI and Chatbots: An Assessment of Artificial Intelligence Technologies for The Public Sector and Public Administration. *Journal of AI*, 8(1), 83–106. <https://doi.org/10.61969/jai.1512906>
- Darmalaksana, W. (2020). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif Studi Pustaka dan Studi Lapangan*. Pre-print Digital Library UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, 1–6.
- Darmalaksana, W., & Kulsum, E. M. (2022). Meningkatkan Kapasitas Berpikir Kritis untuk Tantangan Era Disrupsi 4.0 Berdasarkan Inspirasi Sabda Rasulullah dengan Menggunakan Analisis Higher Order Thinking Skills. *Gunung Djati Conference Series*, 8, 304–318.
- Derrington, D. (n.d.). *Artificial Intelligence for Health and Health Care*. McLean, VA: JASON The MITRE Corporation. <https://doi.org/10.1002/tre.971>
- Dina, L. N. A. B. D., Agustin, N., Sukma, M., & Kusumawati, A. (2020). Pemanfaatan Aplikasi Whatsapp Sebagai Media Alternatif Dalam Pembelajaran Tematik Berbasis Ramah Anak Pada Masa Pandemi COVID-19. *Konferensi Nasional Pendidikan Islam*, 298–306. <http://conference.unisma.ac.id/index.php/KNPI/1/paper/view/1075>
- Firdaus, M. R., Irawan, R. R., Huda, C., Mahardika, Y., Gaol, P. L., & Prinaryanto, B. A. (2023). Tantangan Teknologi Artificial Intelligence pada Kegiatan Pembelajaran Mahasiswa. *Sindoro: Cendekia Pendidikan*, 1(9).
- Harrison, J. H., Gilbertson, J. R., Hanna, M. G., Olson, N. H., Seheult, J. N., Sorace, J. M., & Stram, M. N. (2021). Introduction to Artificial Intelligence and Machine Learning for Pathology. *Archives of Pathology & Laboratory Medicine*, 145(10), 1228–1254. <https://doi.org/10.5858/arpa.2020-0541-CP>
- Informant. (2024). *Wawancara*.

- Karn, A. (2021). Artificial Intelligence in Computer Vision. *International Journal of Engineering Applied Sciences and Technology*, 6(1), 249–254. <https://doi.org/10.1049/cce:19920042>
- Kevitt, P. M., Partridge, D., & Wilks, Y. (1992). Approaches to Natural Language Discourse Processing. *Artificial Intelligence Review*, 6(4), 333–364. <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00123689>
- Kitsantas, T., Georgoulas, P., & Chytis, E. (2024). Integrating Robotic Process Automation with Artificial Intelligence for Business Process Automation: Analysis, Applications, and Limitations. *Journal of System and Management Sciences*. <https://doi.org/10.33168/JSMS.2024.0712>
- Miftahul Huda, & Irwansyah Suwahu. (2024). Peran Artificial Intelligence (Ai) dalam Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam. *REFERENSI ISLAMIKA: Jurnal Studi Islam*, 2(2), 53–61. <https://doi.org/10.61220/ri.v2i2.005>
- Misnawati. (2023). ChatGPT: Keuntungan, Risiko, Dan Penggunaan Bijak Dalam Era Kecerdasan Buatan. *PROSIDING SEMINAR NASIONAL PENDIDIKAN, BAHASA, SASTRA, SENI, DAN BUDAYA*, 2(1), 54–67. <https://doi.org/10.55606/mateandrau.v2i1.221>
- Mohammad Arif. (2021). *Generasi Milenial dalam Internalisasi Karakter Nusantara*. IAIN Kediri Press.
- Pabubung, M. R. (2023). Era Kecerdasan Buatan dan Dampak terhadap Martabat Manusia dalam Kajian Etis. *Jurnal Filsafat Indonesia*, 6(1), 66–74. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jfi.v6i1.49293>
- Pratiwi, D. E., & Agustin, N. (2022). *Pembelajaran Tematik di SD/MI Teori dan Praktik*. UWKS PRESS.
- Pupillo, L., Fantin, S., Ferreira, A. 1960-, & Polito, C. (2021). Artificial intelligence and cybersecurity technology, governance and policy challenges : final report of a CEPS Task Force. Centre for European Policy Studies.
- Reijers, W. (2023). Digital Hermeneutics: Philosophical Investigations in New Media and Technologies. *AI & SOCIETY*, 38(6), 2351–2354. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00146-020-01006-x>
- Rhamadan, R., & Ikhlas, A.-. (2023). Strategi Guru Pendidikan Agama Islam dalam Meningkatkan Kemampuan Membaca Al-Quran bagi Peserta Didik di SMK Negeri 1 Batangtoru. *ISLAMIKA*, 5(1), 84–97. <https://doi.org/10.36088/islamika.v5i1.2392>
- Rifky, S. (2024). Dampak Penggunaan Artificial Intelligence bagi Pendidikan Tinggi. *Indonesian Journal of Multidisciplinary on Social and Technology*, 2(1), 37–42. <https://doi.org/10.31004/ijmst.v2i1.287>
- Rochim, A. A. (2024). Kecerdasan Buatan: Resiko, Tantangan Dan Penggunaan Bijak Pada Dunia Pendidikan. *Antroposen: Journal of Social Studies and Humaniora*, 3(1), 13–25. <https://doi.org/10.33830/antroposen.v3i1.6780>
- Royhan Zaki Ramadhana, & Muhammad Irwan Padli Nasution. (2024). Analisis Dampak Penerapan Teknologi AI pada Pengambilan Keputusan Strategis dalam Sistem Informasi Manajemen. *JURNAL ILMIAH RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT STUDENT*, 2(1), 161–168. <https://doi.org/10.59024/jis.v2i1.579>
- Russel, S., & Norvig, P. (2010). Artificial intelligence. In 2010 The 2nd International

- Conference on Computer and Automation Engineering, ICCAE 2010 (Vol. 4). Pearson Education. <https://doi.org/10.1109/ICCAE.2010.5451578>
- Sarwono, J. (2006). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif dan Kualitatif*. Graha Ilmu.
- Siti Masrichah. (2023). Ancaman Dan Peluang Artificial Intelligence (AI). *Khatulistiwa: Jurnal Pendidikan dan Sosial Humaniora*, 3(3), 83–101. <https://doi.org/10.55606/khatulistiwa.v3i3.1860>
- Sullivan, M. (2022). Scheduling Deliberation 1. *Philosophical Perspectives*, 36(1), 329–344. <https://doi.org/10.1111/phpe.12170>
- Sultan, M., Kamaluddin, K., & Fitriani, F. (2023). Harmonisasi Sosial Keagamaan dan Kemasyarakatan dalam Pandangan Islam dan Kong Hu Cu. *Jurnal Penelitian Medan Agama*, 14(1), 1. <https://doi.org/10.58836/jpma.v14i1.14763>
- Syuhada, S. A., Siregar, D., Jumardi, A., Nabbil, S., Al Ayubi, Z. S., Prasetyo, D., Tauri, D. S., Firdaus, B., & Albaras, M. R. (2024). Dampak AI Pada Proses Belajar Mengajar Di Era Digital. *APPA: Jurnal Pengabdian Kepada Masyarakat*, 2(1), 20–24.
- Vaughn, L. M., & Jacquez, F. (2020). Participatory Research Methods: Choice Points in the Research Process. *Journal of Participatory Research Methods*, 1(1). <https://doi.org/10.35844/001c.13244>
- Widat, F., & Kurniawan, R. S. (2023). Transformation of Tajweed Learning Management Through Digital Method Approach. *MANAGERE: Indonesian Journal of Educational Management*, 5(1), 26–35.